

2. Jennifer M. WEBB and David FRANKEL, *Ambelikou Aletri. Metallurgy and Pottery Production in Middle Bronze Age Cyprus*, Studies in Mediterranean Archaeology Vol. CXXXVIII, Åströms Förlag, Uppsala, 2013, pp. i-xx, 1-245.

ISSN 0081-8232. ISBN 978-91-7081-250-7

Jennifer M. WEBB (ed.), *Structure, Measurement and Meaning. Studies on Prehistoric Cyprus in Honour of David Frankel*, Studies in Mediterranean Archaeology Vol. CXLIII, Åströms Förlag, Uppsala, 2013, pp. i-xx, 1-271. ISSN 0081-8232. ISBN 978-91-981535-1-4

These two volumes represent milestones in the progress of Cypriote archaeology. Both add substantially to the database for interpreting the development of civilisation in prehistoric Cyprus, and both have an input from and for David Frankel and involve Jennifer Webb in the output. In particular they show what can be gleaned from unpublished excavations. Where the first is concerned, it may seem regrettable that the archaeological community has had to wait over 70 years for the final report on Porphyrios Dikaios' excavations at the early Middle Bronze Age site of *Ambelikou Aletri* on the north coast of Cyprus to appear, but it could be said, despite the authors' disclaimers, that the final product has benefited from the delay. This is no criticism of the quality of the fieldwork or the intentions of the archaeological expedition from the Department of Antiquities of Cyprus but a reflection on the accumulated knowledge and experience which Jennifer Webb and David Frankel have brought to bear in writing up the finds from this, the earliest recorded industrial habitation in the ancient copper mining area of the island.

Initiated by the reviewer and carried forward by Anne-Elizabeth Dunn-Vaturi, the project was willingly taken over by this dynamic Australian duo who have raised archaeological research and productivity to a sustained and exemplary level. Not only have they carried out their own excavations with meticulous attention to accuracy and detail and published the results both fully and promptly, they have supervised and vetted the work of others through their university teaching, fieldwork and editorial duties. In the case of *Ambelikou-Aletri* they have written up the report as though they

had undertaken the excavations themselves. From the extant records and material remains they have extracted as much information as possible about the site and its history and made a singular contribution to our knowledge of pottery making and copper processing in the early second millennium B.C. This is all the more valuable because the site itself is now inaccessible and the authors were unable to visit it.

Webb and Frankel have covered every aspect of the 1942 campaign, beginning with the location and nature of the site, history of excavation and publication, and chronology, about which there is no dispute. The finds belong to Middle Cypriote I to early Middle Cypriote II, within the late 20th century B.C. and the early 19th century B.C. This introductory section is usefully followed by a chapter on the mining geology of Cyprus with special reference to *Ambelikou-Aletri*, contributed by George Constantinou and Ioannis Panayides. They observe that the Bronze Age miners at the site were extracting copper sulphide minerals to produce metallic copper, and that this is currently the earliest known exploitation of these ores in Cyprus. After reviewing the evidence for ancient mining, initial soundings and trial trenches, the authors give detailed descriptions of Areas 1 and 2 of the settlement, accompanied by excellent plans and archival photographs. This is all the more creditable given the lack of surviving field notes.

Substantial parts of the volume are devoted to the ceramic corpus, ground stone assemblage and small finds, as well as shorter sections on the pXRF analysis of the pottery and XRD analysis of the metal items. The great majority

of the registered vases and sherds belong to Red Polished Ware, and no White Painted Ware of any kind was encountered. The corpus included a few Drab Polished Ware vases, which indicate a connection with the western region of the island involving some movement of pottery at this time. While stone tools indicate use for the processing of copper ores, the small finds suggest a wide variety of other activities at the site. Of particular note are the two Red Polished figurines, the only ones of their kind so far recovered from a Bronze Age settlement as opposed to a cemetery. In their concluding chapter Webb and Frankel have made a masterful summary of the data, arguing that the evidence leaves no doubt that all stages in the *chaîne opératoire* of copper processing, from mining, copper ore beneficiation and smelting to the casting of ingots were fully carried out at the site, and that pottery was manufactured in a workshop in Area 2, the only such installation recorded from Bronze Age Cyprus.

The importance of this report lies not only in the value which the authors have added to the raw data but in the fact that present conditions do not allow any more excavations to take place in this locality. It also throws into relief the virtual cessation of scientific fieldwork in the northern part of the island where all excavation is considered illegal by the Republic of Cyprus, and Greek Cypriotes will not publicly acknowledge the existence of any archaeological finds made or published from there, whatever the circumstances. Only material recovered before 1974 can be legitimately studied and published. There is certainly more than enough of it to go round. After 40 years of separation the result has been a growing divide in the volume of data being extracted from the Government controlled areas, where permits are still issued on the same basis as before, and the void in the north. This imbalance, to which little explicit attention is given in the contemporary literature, will progressively distort the archaeological record

and in future prevent valid holistic syntheses of the island's prehistory. Only emulation of Webb's and Frankel's valiant efforts will help redress an otherwise unsustainable academic situation.

In the light of the foregoing report it is not surprising that David Frankel should have been honoured with a Festschrift on the occasion of his retirement from La Trobe University in the state of Victoria, Australia. It is equally fitting that it should have been edited by Jennifer Webb and published in the same series of which they are both co-editors. Having as its theme the prehistory of Cyprus, defined by such amorphous concepts as "structure, measurement and meaning" but not by any chronological parameters, it contains, appropriately enough, a miscellany of studies by assorted specialists in the field, chosen from one side of the discipline's linguistic divide, confirming, if proof were needed, that Cypriote archaeology, despite all its trappings of modernity, remains stuck in the 19th century A.D. All the contributors are Anglo-Saxon and Cypriote or Greek, with one notable Anglophone (Italian) exception, Luca Bombardieri, and the whole volume is written in English. There is no hint that anyone outside this charmed circle was invited to join in. Nor does it seem that the papers were peer reviewed.

The volume's coverage ranges from the Epipalaeolithic down to the Iron Age, with the Bronze Age receiving most of the attention, and while Webb has grouped the papers under generic headings – society and process, sites and their settings, and material and social transformations – the contents break down more simply into the archaeological and the abstract. Belonging to the former category is Webb's own thoughtful essay on the socio-economic implications of pottery manufacture in the Bronze Age, abandoning the model of household production in favour of a degree of industrial specialisation. Arrival at this reasonable conclusion was facilitated by the finds from *Ambelikou-Aletri*. In a more

unexpected contribution, vitiated only by the erroneous conviction that Cyprus was ancient Alashiya, A.B. Knapp has assembled all the archaeological data for shipping in the Late Cypriote period and analysed it with welcome sagacity. For him, as for others, transportation over water is essentially an overseas not internal phenomenon, and he does not directly address the (improbable) use of boats on the island's rivers at this time. In particular he constructively queries the proposition that an entrepôt on the Asiatic coast served as a transit point for Cypriote goods such as ingots and pottery, and sensibly doubts that it is possible, even necessary to try to work out the "nationality" of the Uluburun shipwreck. It should be pointed out in this regard that definitive reports on the metal ingots and ceramics from this vessel are still awaited. Without them we are still working on incomplete information.

Contrary to the view once expressed to me by a Mycenaean pottery specialist that all *Festschrift* articles are ephemeral and will never be read, let alone consulted again, several articles in this volume should retain a permanent reference value. The most enduring will be Giorgos Georgiou's description of unpublished Early and Middle Cypriote tombs in the Skouriotissa area, and Despina Pilides' revelatory account of the evidence for the Bronze Age settlement in Nicosia. The usefulness of archaeological surveys is also clearly demonstrated by Alison South's paper on population estimates for the Late Bronze Age in the Vasilikos Valley, particularly Kalavassos; by Andrew McCarthy's survey of the Dhiarizos Valley, including his excavations at *Prasteio-Mesorotsos*; and by Maria Iacovou's review of the environment in the ancient Paphos region, in which she cites Georgiou's unpublished thesis in Greek on *The Topography of Human Settlement in Cyprus in the Early and Middle Bronze Age* (2007). It is high time this important work was made publicly available to us all.

In addition to Webb's contribution, another three papers deal expertly with the re-interpretation of old archaeological data. Diana Bolger and Edgar Peltenburg have made an authoritatively sourced, cogently argued and persuasive case for the antecedents of the Philia Phase to be found, in part at least, in the late Chalcolithic period. The Sanctuary of the Horned God at Enkomi *Ayios Iakovos*, excavated by Porphyrios Dikaios, is thoroughly reinvestigated by George Papasavvas, who with good reason states that Dikaios' fieldwork at the site was "one of the most beneficial things ever to happen in Cypriot archaeology" but curiously makes no use of the relevant parts of Lindy Crewe's exceptional study on *Early Enkomi. Regionalism, trade and society at the beginning of the Late Bronze Age on Cyprus* (Oxford 2007). Nor does Vasiliki Kassianidou in her contribution on copper production in the Iron Age. And Crewe herself re-examines the ceramic evidence for cultural regionalism in the Kissonerga area in south-western Cyprus at the start of the Bronze Age, based on her finds from the settlement site at *Skalia*, which for the first time in this part of the island shows continuous occupation from Late Chalcolithic down to the Early Cypriote period.

One thing this volume highlights is the unfortunate situation the archaeological community finds itself in over its essential terms of reference. While no-one expects there to be unanimous agreement over the absolute dates for the Stone and Bronze Ages in Cyprus, it is a shame we continue to have inconsistent or differing systems of relative chronology. Stuart Manning uses his latest radiocarbon dates to review the history of copper production in the island, and wisely concludes that so little is known about the early stages of Cyprus' metals industry, "it is important not to write too confidently about an interpolated historical narrative in between the few known episodes". For his framework, however, he refers indiscriminately to the Philia 'facies', the Philia

facies and Philia (unqualified) to designate the phase between Late Chalcolithic and Early Cypriote I-II, while McCartney uses Philia facies, Philia ‘culture’ and Philia (unqualified), and others have these designations plus Philia culture or cultural phase, Philia period and Philia EB. Ironically Webb who with Frankel introduced and promoted Philia facies, refers only to the Philia EC period, the Philia phase of the EC period, and Philia (unqualified) ! Can we not all agree on just one term, like Philia Phase?

It is no less unfortunate that Knapp’s superfluous terms like “PreBA” and “ProBA” with their subdivisions have percolated into the literature. He takes it as so read we know what he is talking about, he gives no correlations of these terms with the conventional relative chronology employed in the rest of the volume, except in Andrew Snedden’s theoretical contribution. On one point, however, there is near complete consistency throughout the text, and that is the appearance of absolute dates with the suffix BC or B.C., not the politically correct and totally unnecessary BCE. This must have been specifically allowed by the editor in an act of grace, as the only exception to the general rule is Webb herself. The volume itself is handsomely produced, very well proof read, and includes a preface by Frankel himself, a list of his publications and another of the contributors, but no *tabula gratulatoria* or index. When I was invited to be one of the contributors, I responded positively, on the assumption that an historiographical paper dealing, *inter alia*, with “prehistoric” artefacts would fit comfortably

within the specified guidelines, but I was told it might not. Accordingly I withdrew my offer, but nor before having drafted the following tribute:

“David Frankel is truly an archaeological ‘man for all seasons’. From the Old World to the New and back again he has straddled several universes at the same time and left his imprint on all of them with undisputed professionalism. If he has made Cyprus the focus of his primary academic specialisation, it has not been at the expense of his contributions to Australian prehistory and the role of archaeology in contemporary society, and there is scarcely a field of antiquarian endeavour which he has not addressed in one way or another during the course of his varied career. Though historiography may not have been one of his main areas of research, his work on past excavations in Cyprus and established collections of Cypriote antiquities has shown an open-minded appreciation of the way every aspect of the discipline can illuminate the past and bring us closer to understanding the forces which help shape the process of historical reconstruction. In honouring David’s achievements, I have chosen as my subject a significant and engaging collector and dealer in Cypriote antiquities with an Australian connection who was active in Famagusta in the period between the First and Second World Wars”.

This article now appears in the current issue of the *Cahier*.

Robert S. MERRILLEES

3. VASSOS KARAGEORGHIS and Athanasia KANTA, *Pyla-Kokkinokremos. A Late 13th Century BC Fortified Settlement in Cyprus. Excavations 2010 – 2011*, Studies in Mediterranean Archaeology Vol. CXLI, Åströms Förlag, Uppsala, 2014, pp. i-xxvi, 1-260.

ISSN : 0081-8232. ISBN : 978-91-981535-0-7.

Extracting historical fact from archaeological data is a challenging and frequently challenged undertaking for all specialists in the field. Without written records that can be read it is impossible to be certain that the evidence has

been correctly interpreted. Even then written sources from antiquity were not set down for the benefit of contemporary scholars but for the needs of those days and are random, incomplete and themselves often difficult to understand